AN OPEN REPLY LETTER TO THE FEDERATION INTERNATIONALE DE L'AUTOMOBILE

October 6, 2020

JEAN TODT

President

FEDERATION INTERNATIONALE DE L'AUTOMOBILE

8 place de la Concorde 75008 Paris, France

Dear Mr Jean Todt,

On August 20, 2020, over a hundred civil society groups and individuals sent you a letter calling on the Fédération Internationale de l'Automobile (FIA) to end tobacco advertising in Formula 1. This letter was sent in the hope that, as a United Nations (UN) envoy and a self-proclaimed supporter of the UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), you will recognize that the greatest contribution you can make toward sustainable development is to end tobacco sponsorship in your own backyard.

On September 9, 2020, we received your response to our letter. Much like the tobacco industry, you ignored key facts about your role in the problem and your opportunities to truly address the issue.

Firstly, you ignored the fact of youth exposure to tobacco sports advertisingⁱ and the cross-border nature of race promotions and coverage, then placed the burden solely on governments to regulate the sport that FIA governs. *48 countries ban tobacco advertising comprehensively*ⁱⁱ *and 25 countries specifically ban tobacco sports advertising.*ⁱⁱⁱ Contrary to your assertion that "no public enforcer, nor any judge has adopted any adversarial position against the new Winnow Mission (sic) or Better Tomorrow initiatives in consideration of the rules prohibiting sponsorship or advertising of tobacco products or like-products," a French tribunal found that the tobacco advertising for Mission Winnow violated the public health law.^{iv} Australian authorities also launched an investigation into the branding.^v If tobacco brands were not on F1 cars, there would be no need for governments to use up scarce public resources just to prohibit cross-border broadcasts.

Secondly, you have taken on "UN-aligned" initiatives^{vi}, both personally and through <u>FIA</u>, without waiting <u>for government regulation</u>. This demonstrates that FIA is in a position to take governance efforts to end tobacco sponsorship but simply refuses to do so^{vii}. You could have ended tobacco sponsorship through the newly signed Concorde Agreement, but failed to do so.

Finally, your assertion that "the tobacco industry itself must more actively contribute to community efforts" contradicts global consensus as well as UN norms, values and human rights principles that we have highlighted in our previous letter. VIII

In summary, FIA has the authority to govern its stakeholders without waiting for government action; yet it refuses to do so and continues to deliberately allow tobacco advertising and sponsorship, while advancing a misleading assertion as to the industry's role to "contribute to community efforts." It then shifts the responsibility solely onto governments, despite the fact that governments' main barrier to regulating tobacco, reducing tobacco use and attaining the UN SDGs, is tobacco industry interference.

Your failure to address the issue, in effect, advances tobacco industry interests that are in conflict with the SDGs, and ignores the millions who became addicted to tobacco use and died as a result. This tarnishes the sport's reputation in the global community and the legacy that you and the FIA will leave behind.

As part of our commitment to further sustainable development, we have a moral responsibility to help protect health policies from the influence of the tobacco industry and those furthering its interests. We also have a legal duty to ensure that governments do not violate their obligation to protect their policies against the commercial and vested interests of the tobacco industry. Hence, we do not meet with those who are furthering tobacco industry interests.

Until you take action to end tobacco sponsorship in the sport, we and the rest of civil society will continue to call you and FIA out at every opportunity and will escalate the matter to the pertinent sustainable development fora.

It is shameful that you/FIA tout international commitments to improve lives while actively aligning with tobacco companies, whose products take lives and whose activities exploit the most vulnerable in our society.

Sincerely,

Signed

- 1. Action on Smoking and Health (ASH US), Laurent Huber, Executive Director, United States
- 2. **Action on Smoking and Health, Philippines**, Ma. Encarnita B. Limpin, Executive Director, Philippines
- 3. Action on Smoking and Health, UK, Deborah Arnott, Chief Executive, United Kingdom
- 4. African Tobacco Control Alliance, Togo
- 5. Airspace Action on Smoking and Health, Errol E. Povah, President, Canada
- 6. **Alianza por control de las Enfermedades no Transmisibles Chile**, Dra. Maria Paz Corvalan, Directorio Sociedad Chilena de Enfermedades Respiratorias, Chile
- 7. **Aminul Islam Sujon**, Executive Member, Poribesh Bachao Andolon POBA (Save the Environment Movement), Bangladesh
- 8. ASH Canada, Les Hagen, Executive Director, Canada
- 9. ASH Finland, Mervi Hara, Executive Director, Finland
- 10. ASH Scotland, Sheila Duffy, Chief Executive, United Kingdom
- 11. Asociación Española de Afectados de Cáncer de Pulmón, Spain
- 12. Association DNF Pour un monde ZeroTabac, Gérard Audureau, President, France
- 13. Asthma UK, United Kingdom
- 14. Australian Council on Smoking and Health, Maurice Swanson, Executive Director, Australia
- 15. Australian Health Promotion Association, Gemma Crawford, President, Australia
- 16. Balajee Sewa Sansthan, Awadhesh Kumar, Executive Director, India
- 17. British Lung Foundation, United Kingdom
- 18. **Campaign for Tobacco-Free Kids**, Debra Rosen, Head of Tobacco Industry Accountability, United States
- 19. Cancer Council Australia, Megan Varlow, Acting Chief Executive Officer, Australia
- 20. Carolyn Dresler, MD, MPA, United States
- 21. Center for Indonesia's Strategic Development initiatives (CISDI), Lara Rizka, Project Officer (Tobacco Control), Indonesia
- 22. Center for Social Security Studies, University of Indonesia, Ir. Aryana Satrya, Chairman, Indonesia
- 23. Centre for Combating Tobacco, University of Colombo, Mahesh Rajasuriya, MD, Director, Sri Lanka
- 24. Coalition for a Tobacco Free Arkansas, Katherine Donald, Executive Director, United States
- 25. Coalition México Salud-Hable, Mexico
- 26. **Comité Nacional para la Prevención del Tabaquismo (CNPT)**, Andrés Zamorano, President, Spain
- 27. Comité National Contre le Tabagisme, Yves Martinet, President, France
- 28. Consumers Association of Penang (CAP), Mohideen Abdul Kader, President, Malaysia
- 29. **Coral Gartner**, Head, Nicotine and Tobacco Regulatory Science Research Group, The University of Queensland, School of Public Health, Australia
- 30. Corporate Accountability and Public Participation Africa (CAPPA), Akinbode Oluwafemi, Executive Director, Nigeria
- 31. Development and Policies Research Center, Nguyen Ngoc Anh, Director, Vietnam
- 32. **Dinej Chandrasiri**, Divisional Registered Medical Officer, Regional Directorate of Health Services-Puttlam, Sri Lanka
- 33. E. Madhurangi Perera, Doctor, Ministry of Health, Nutrition and Indigenous Medicine, Sri Lanka
- 34. Elizabeth A. Smith, Professor, University of California, San Francisco, United States
- 35. European Healthy Stadia, Dr. Dr. Matthew Philpott, PhD, Executive Director, United Kingdom

- 36. **European Network for Smoking and Tobacco Prevention ENSP**, Dr. Francisco Rodriguez Lozano, President, Belgium
- 37. **FAECAP Federation of Family and Community Nursing Associations**, Adelaida Lozano Polo, Coordinator group of smoking, Spain
- 38. Framework Convention Alliance, Francis Thompson, Executive Director, Canada
- 39. Framework Convention on Tobacco Control Alliance, Philippines, Roberto del Rosario, President, Philippines
- 40. Fresh (Making Smoking History), Ailsa Rutter, Director, United Kingdom
- 41. **Gérard Dubois**, Member, French National Academy of Medicine, France
- 42. Global Center for Good Governance in Tobacco Control (GGTC), Nuntavarn Vichit-Vadakan, Chair, Thailand
- 43. Healis Sekhsaria Institute of Public Health, Mira B. Aghi, Consulting Behavioral Scientist, India
- 44. HealthBridge Foundation of Canada Vietnam Office, Nguyen Thi An, Director, Vietnam
- 45. **HealthJustice Philippines**, Jacky Sarita, Managing Director, Philippines
- 46. **Helen Walters**, Consultant in Public Health Medicine, United Kingdom
- 47. HRIDAY, Radhika Shrivastav, Director Health Promotion, India
- 48. Indonesian Consumer Organization (YKLI), Muji Rizgiany, Indonesia
- 49. Israeli Medical Association for Smoking Cessation and Prevention, Yael Bar-Zeev, Chair, Israel
- 50. Janet Hoek, Professor of Public Health and Marketing, University of Otago, New Zealand
- 51. **Jim McCambridge**, Professor, University of York, United Kingdom
- 52. John Moxham, Emeritus Professor, King's College London, United Kingdom
- 53. Lithuanian Tobacco and Alcohol Control Coalition, Nijole Gostautaite Midttun, President, Lithuania
- 54. **Malaysian Academy of Pharmacy**, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mohd Zulkefeli Bin Mat Jusoh, Principal, Malaysia
- 55. Malaysian Council for Tobacco Control, Datuk Dr. Lekhraj Rampal, President, Malaysia
- 56. Malaysian Green Lung Association, Ho Rhu Yann, Founding President, Malaysia
- 57. Malaysian Pharmaceutical Society, Amrahi Buang, President, Malaysia
- 58. **Mark Levin**, Professor of Law, Wm. S. Richardson School of Law, The University of Hawaii at Manoa, United States
- 59. **Mark Petticrew**, Professor of Public Health, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, United Kingdom
- 60. Martin White, Professor, Vice President, UK Society of Behavioural Medicine, United Kingdom
- 61. MyWATCH, Roslizawati Md Ali, President, Malaysia
- 62. National Committee on Tobacco Control, Hasbullah Thabrany, President, Indonesia
- 63. Nicholas Hopkinson, Reader in Respiratory Medicine, Imperial College, London, United Kingdom
- 64. Nofumadores.org (non-smokers.org), Raquel Fernandez Megina, President, Spain
- 65. **Norwegian Cancer Society**, Nonguebzanga Maxime Compaore, Special Advisor, International Affairs, Norway
- 66. **Oswaldo Cruz Foundation**, Silvana Rubano Turci, Coordinator of the Observatory of the Strategies of the Tobacco Industry of the Tobacco and Health Studies Center, Brazil
- 67. OxySuisse, Pascal Diethelm, President, Switzerland
- 68. **Pandit Govind Ballabh Pant Institute of Studies in Rural Development**, Shiv Pujan Pandey, Director, India
- 69. People's Health Foundation, Dr. Than Sein, President, Myanmar
- 70. Portuguese Lung Cancer Study Group, Portugal
- 71. Portuguese Society of Pulmonology, António Morais, President, Portugal
- 72. **Priscilla Alderson**, Professor Emerita, University College London, United Kingdom
- 73. PROGGA, ABM Zubair, Executive Director, Bangladesh
- 74. Red PaPaz, Carolina Piñeros, Executive Director, Colombia
- 75. Resource Centre for Primary Health Care, Shanta Lall Mulmi, Executive Director, Nepal
- 76. **Rob Moodie**, Professor of Public Health, Melbourne School of Population and Global Health, Australia

- 77. **Roengrudee Patanavanich**, Deputy Director, Tobacco Control Research and Knowledge Management Center (TRC), Thailand
- 78. **Shaun Cavanagh**, Post-graduate, Diploma in Public Health, Department of Preventive and Social Medicine, University of Otago, New Zealand
- 79. Simon Chapman, Emeritus Professor, University of Sydney School of Public Health, Australia
- 80. Sirach Loysmut, Faculty of Communication Arts, Rangsit University, Thailand
- 81. Slovenska zveza za javno zdravje, okolje in tobačno kontrolo, Mihaela Lovše, President, Slovenia
- 82. Smoke Free Israel, Shira Kislev, CEO, Israel
- 83. **Sociedad Española de Espacialistas en Tabaquismo (SEDET)**, César Minué-Lorenzo, President, Spain
- 84. Southeast Asia Tobacco Control Alliance, Ulysses Dorotheo, Executive Director, Philippines
- 85. Spanish Federation of Allergy and Airways Diseases Patients' Associations (FENAER), Armando Ruiz, Global Relationships Manager, Spain
- 86. **Stephan Lewandowsky**, Professor, School of Psychological Science and Cabot Institute, University of Bristol, United Kingdom
- 87. Tanzania Tobacco Control Forum, Lutgard Kokulinda Kagaruki, Executive Director, Tanzania
- 88. The Union, Gan Quan, Director of Tobacco Control, United States
- 89. Tobacco Free Association of Zambia, Brenda Chitindi, Executive Director, Zambia
- 90. Tobacco Control Alliance, George Bakhturidze, Chairman, Georgia
- 91. **Tobacco Control Research Group, University of Bath**, Anna Gilmore, Director, United Kingdom
- 92. UK Faculty of Public Health, Prof. Maggie Rae, President, United Kingdom
- 93. Unfairtobacco, Sonja von Eichborn, Director, Germany
- 94. Universita del Terzo Settore, Maria Luisa Pagano, President, Italy
- 95. **Vietnam Non-communicable Diseases Prevention and Control Alliance**, Ha Thu Tran (RTCCD Executive Director) & Tran Tuan (Chairman, NCDs-VN), Vietnam
- 96. **Vision for Alternative Development (VALD)**, Labram Massawudu Musah, Programmes Director, Ghana
- 97. Vital Strategies, Sandra Mullin, Senior Vice President, United States
- 98. Widyastuti Soerojo, Indonesia
- 99. World Heart Federation, Florence Berteletti, Director for Advocacy, Switzerland
- 100. Yong Check Yoon, Independent researcher, Malaysia















































































































































Unfairtobacco









EXCERPTS FROM OPEN LETTER TO JEAN TODT (dated August 20, 2020)

We, members of civil society, earnestly call on you to put an end to all tobacco advertising and sponsorship in Formula 1.

- The sport represents one of the last vestiges of Big Tobacco's global marketing to lure young people into addiction through sports.
- FIA's global commitments start to ring hollow despite your initiatives as UN
 Special Envoy for Road Safety, and efforts to sign Formula 1 up to join the UN
 Sports for Climate Action Framework. FIA's commitment to protect the planet
 and promote safety is a sham if it continues to be a vehicle for tobacco
 sponsorships that contribute to killing people and destroying the planet."
- Continued tobacco sponsorship in Formula 1, and the promotion of tobacco company's brands, either directly through brand stretching and extensions, on and off the track is a violation of public health laws and United Nations (UN) norms.
- Rather than aligning with the UN, FIA is, in effect, furthering the tobacco industry's interests by receiving annual payments from teams funded by tobacco companies, and allowing the teams to advertise tobacco company brands and messages.
- Turning a blind eye on a moral or legal wrong breeds corruption. If FIA's
 rules allow for teams to run on money gained from selling products that kill
 millions, then it should change the rules. It is not deserving of its governance
 position unless it does so.

Our letter clearly stated that "Tobacco brands on the racetracks stream across borders via multiple media channels and through computer games into the youth's consciousness. The sport has the second-highest proportion of fans under age 25 of all global sports leagues. FIA's failure to remove tobacco advertisements and messaging from the sport could make it complicit in tobacco company marketing to youth."

World Health Organization. (2019). WHO Report on the Global Tobacco Epidemic, 2019. Retrieved from: https://www.who.int/tobacco/global_report/en/ (accessed on 21 April 2020).

iii Campaign for Tobacco Free Kids. (n.d.) Tobacco Control Laws: Policy Fact Sheet. Retrieved from: https://www.tobaccocontrollaws.org/legislation/factsheet/ (accessed on 21 April 2020).

iv Comité National Contre Le Tabagisme. (n.d). French motorcycle Grand Prix of Le Mans: Justice rules in favor of the National Committee for Tobacco Control (CNCT) and prohibits the return of Philip Morris on the racing circuits. Retrieved from: https://cnct.fr/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/Press-release-%E2%80%93-Mission-Winnow-English-1.pdf (accessed 5 October 2020). – PMI and Ducati were fined *in relation to the Grand Prix of Le Mans motorcycle. Philip Morris and Ferrari removed visual traces and mention of Mission Winnow on cars, team name, and clothes of the drivers and staff,*

^v Australian Communication and Media Authority. (2019). Investigation report no. BI-458. Australian Government. Retrieved from: https://www.acma.gov.au/sites/default/files/2019-09/BI-458-Fox-tobacco.docx (accessed on 21 April 2020).

vi We noted in our letter that "FIA's global commitments start to ring hollow despite your initiatives as UN Special Envoy for Road Safety, and efforts to sign Formula 1 up to join the UN Sports for Climate Action Framework. FIA's commitment to protect the planet and promote safety is a sham if it continues to be a vehicle for tobacco sponsorships that contribute to killing people and destroying the planet. Even if FIA manages to reduce Formula 1's 256,551 tons of carbon footprint (2019), it continues to contribute 845,000 tons of cigarette butts per year.

This staggering amount of waste kills animals, pollutes land and sea, slows sustainable consumption and undermines the basic principles of the UN framework."

- vii You were made aware that the "...the Olympics, which recognized FIA in 2012, is tobacco-free. All other major global sports series have ended tobacco sponsorships." And that "Turning a blind eye on a moral or legal wrong breeds corruption. If FIA's rules allow for teams to run on money gained from selling products that kill millions, then it should change the rules. It is not deserving of its governance position unless it does so."
- viii We elaborated in our letter why tobacco companies have no place in societal development and yet you assert their "contribution to the community" Particularly, we said that:
 - "tobacco companies are still responsible for 8 million deaths and USD 1.4 trillion in economic losses annually. It is shameful that Formula 1 has made USD 4.4 billion over the years from tobacco companies culpable for this disaster. FIA must put a stop to this and prevent complicity in violating laws and UN standards."
 - "Tobacco companies have been found guilty of fraud and racketeering."
 - "The UN specifically recognizes the fundamental conflict of interest between the tobacco industry and public health, which is incorporated in the UN SDGs. A resolution of the UN Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) urged agencies of the UN System to reject partnerships with organizations furthering tobacco industry interests."
 - "A total of 182 countries have ratified the World Health Organization Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (WHO FCTC) mandating a comprehensive ban on advertising. WHO FCTC implementation has become engrained in the UN Sustainable Development Goals (UN SDGs)."
 - "Rather than aligning with the UN, FIA is, in effect, furthering the tobacco industry's interests by receiving annual payments from teams funded by tobacco companies, and allowing the teams to advertise tobacco company brands and messages." (emphasis supplied)

^{ix} SDG Target 3.a requires implementation of the WHO FCTC to reduce non-communicable diseases. WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC) requires governments, under General Obligation Article 5.3, to protect public health interests from the commercial and vested interests of the tobacco industry. According to the FCTC, civil society plays an essential role in treaty implementation.